Sonny Dean Plant General Manager



R.E. GINNA NUCLEAR POWER PLANT R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant, LLC 1503 Lake Road Ontario, New York 14519-9364 585.771.5205 585.771.3943 Fax sonny.dean@cenglic.com

December 2, 2011

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001

ATTENTION:

Document Control Desk

SUBJECT:

R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant

Docket No. 50-244

LER 2011-003, Reactor Trip Due to Failure of Turbine Lube Oil Piping

The attached Licensee Event Report (LER) 2011-003 is submitted under the provisions of NUREG-1022, Event Reporting Guidelines. There are no new commitments contained in this submittal. Should you have any questions regarding the information in this letter, please contact Mr. Thomas Harding at (585) 771-5219.

Very truly yours,

Edwin D. Dean III

Attachments: (1) LER 2011-003

CC:

W.M. Dean, NRC

D.V. Pickett, NRC

Resident Inspector, NRC (Ginna)

IE22 NUL

ATTACHMENT 1

LER 2011-003

NPC FORM 366 U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION APPROVED BY OMB. NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES: 10/31/2013																
U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COM (10-2010) LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) (See reverse for required number of digits/characters for each block)						1 COMMINIC	E re lik ei C in al	APPROVED BY OMB: NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES: 10/31/2013 Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burder estimate to the FOIA/Privacy Section (T-5 F53), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by intermet e-mail to infocollects.resource@nrc.gov, and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202, (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.					collection into the g burden egulatory mail to formation ment and formation NRC may			
1. FACILITY NAME R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant								2.	05000 244 3. PAGE 1 OF 4							
4. TITLE	Re	eactor	Trip D	ue to Fail	ure of	Turbine	e Lube	Oil Pip	ing	•	·			·		
5. EV	ENT D	ATE	6. LER NUMBER			7. REPORT DATE		ATE	8. OTHER FACILIT			CILITI	TIES INVOLVED DDCKET NUMBER			
MONTH	DAY	YEAR	YEAR	SEQUENTIA NUMBER	REV NO.	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	FACILITY					050	000	
10	11	2011	2011	- 003	- 0	12	02	2011	FACILITY	NAME					000	MBER
9. OPER	ATING	MODE	11.	THIS REPO	RT IS S	SUBMITTE	D PURSU	JANT TO	THE RE	QUIREMENT	rs of 10) CFR	§: (Check	all tha	at app	oly)
1			☐ 20.2201(b) ☐ 20.2201(d) ☐ 20.2203(a)(1) ☐ 20.2203(a)(2)(i)			☐ 20.2203(a)(3)(i) ☐ 20.2203(a)(3)(ii) ☐ 20.2203(a)(4) ☐ 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A)				☐ 50.73(a)(2)(i)(C) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(iii)			☐ 50.73(a)(2)(vii) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)			
10. POWER LEVEL			□ 20.2203(a)(2)(ii) □ 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A) □ 20.2203(a)(2)(iii) □ 50.36(c)(2) □ 20.2203(a)(2)(iv) □ 50.46(a)(3)(ii) □ 20.2203(a)(2)(v) □ 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A) □ 20.2203(a)(2)(vi) □ 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B))(ii))(i)(A)	☐ 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A) ☐ 73.71(a)(4) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B) ☐ 73.71(a)(5) ☐ 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C) ☐ OTHER				below					
				.203(a)(2)(vi)		,	00.73(a)(2))(I)(B)	Ц	30.73(a)(2)	(V)(D)					
			20.2	.200(a)(2)(vi)			SEE CON				(v)(D)					
FACILITY N		larding		sing Dire	1						TE			IRC For	rm 36	6A
		larding	, Licen	sing Dire	ctor	2. LICEN	SEE CON	TACT FO	R THIS I		TE (5	585)	or in N NE NUMBER 771-52	IRC For	rm 36	6A
	nas H	larding system	, Licen	ISING DIFE	ctor	2. LICENS	SEE CON	DNENT F	R THIS I	ER	TE (5	585) REP	or in N NE NUMBER 771-52	RC For	e Area	6A
Thom	nas H		, Licen	ISING DIFE	ctor E LINE MANU-	2. LICENS FOR EAC REPORT	H COMPO	DNENT F	OR THIS I	ER DESCRIBED	TE (5	585) REP	OF IN NUMBER 771-52 DRT MANU	RC For	e Area	Code)
Thom caus B	nas H	SYSTEM TD	, Licen 13. COM COM F	ISING DIFE	CTOT E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPOR	FOR EAC	H COMPO ORTABLE O EPIX NO	DNENT F	OR THIS I	DESCRIBED SYSTEM 15. EXI SUBM	THE (E) IN THIS COMPONE	585) REPONENT	OF IN NUMBER 771-52 DRT MANU	RC For	REPO	Code)
CAUS B	SE (If ye	SYSTEM TD 1-	, Licen 13. COM COM F 4. SUPP	ISING DIFE	Ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPOR	POR EAC REPORT TO	H COMPO ORTABLE O EPIX NO TED	CA	OR THIS I	DESCRIBED SYSTEM 15. EXI SUBM	THE (SE IN THIS COMPONENT OF THE PECTED	585) REPONENT	or in N NE NUMBEF 771-52 ORT MANU- FACTUR	RC For	REPO	Code)
B YE ABSTRA	S (If ye	SYSTEM TD 1. es, comple iit to 1400 s	Licen 13. COM COM F 4. SUPP ete 15. E spaces, i.e	PSP LEMENTAL EXPECTED S a., approximate	ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPOR	POR EAC REPORT RT EXPECT SION DAT gle-spaced Nuclea	H COMPOORTABLE DEPIX NO TED typewritten ar Powe	DNENT F. CA NO lines)	AILURE I	DESCRIBED SYSTEM 15. EXI SUBM	TE (5) IN THIS COMPONE	natio	or in None Number 771-52 ORT MANU FACTUR MONTH	(Include 19 ER DAY	REPO TO	Code) RTABLE EPIX YEAR
B YE ABSTRA On (100°) rese	S (If year CT (Limit Country) Portocolor.	SYSTEM TD 10 es, comple int to 1400 s Der 11, wer. Th	Licen 13. COM COM F 4. SUPP etc 15. E 2011, ne trip ailed pi	PSP LEMENTAL EXPECTED S a., approximate the R.E. was causiping resu	ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPORE EUBMISS Bly 15 sin Ginna sed by alted in	POR EACE REPORT TO THE PORT OF	H COMPO ORTABLE O EPIX NO TED TED typewritten ar Power e of the	NENT F CA NO lines) er Plante turbin ine Au	AILURE I	SYSTEM 15. EXI SUBM DA ienced ar oil piping Trip oil p	COMPONENTE A auton internoressur	matical to	or in None NUMBER 771-52 DRT MANUFACTUR MONTH creactor the turk vitches	r tripoine	REPO TO	Code) RTABLE EPIX YEAR O OIL
B Second Contract Co	S (If year CT (Lime County) County October County) County October County Oil	SYSTEM TD 1. es, comple oit to 1400 s per 11, wer. Th . The fa	Licen 13. COM COM Full	PSP LEMENTAL EXPECTED S a., approximate the R.E. was caus iping resu ne contro	ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPOF	FOR EAC REPET TO SION DAT gle-spaced a failur n the ma	H COMPOORTABLE DEPIX NO TED typewritten ar Power of the ain turb ors performs	NENT F. CA I NO lines) er Plant e turbin ine Au formed	AILURE I USE t experie lube to Stop	SYSTEM 15. EXISUBM DO enced ar oil piping Trip oil p	COMPONIESSION ATE	matic al to re sw	or in Non The NUMBER 771-52 ORT MANUE FACTUR MONTH c reacto the turk vitches proced	r trip	REPO TO	Code) RTABLE EPIX YEAR O Oil G O),
B DYE ABSTRA On (100° rese on lo Rea	S (If year CT (Lime Country oir ow oil ctor]	SYSTEM TD 1. es, comple oit to 1400 s Der 11, wer. Th . The fa I pressi	Licen 13. COM F 4. SUPP ete 15. E 2011, ne trip ailed pi ure. Th Safety	DEMENTAL EXPECTED STATES CAUSING POST OF THE R.E. Was causing resume control Injection	ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPOR CUBMIS Ginna Sed by alted in room and E	FOR EAC REPET	H COMPO ORTABLE D EPIX NO TED typewritten ar Power of the ain turb ors performed Reacto	ONENT F. CA I NO lines) er Plante turbin ine Autrone der Trip F	AILURE I USE t experie lube to Stop I the ap	SYSTEM 15. EXI SUBM DA ienced ar oil piping Trip oil p	PECTED ISSION ATE	matical to re swins of ne re	MANU. FACTUR MONTH creacto the turl vitches proced actor tr	r trip oine activation, ali	REPO TO Iube	Code) RTABLE EPIX YEAR O Oil G O),
B Second Contract Co	S (If year CT (Limit of the CT) (Limit of the CT	system TD 10 es, comple oit to 1400 s Der 11, wer. Th . The fa I pressi I pressi I pressi Crip or operate se of the	Licen 13. COM COM Full	PSP LEMENTAL EXPECTED S a., approximate the R.E. was caus iping resu ne contro Injection designed	ctor E LINE MANU- ACTURE N/A REPORE BUBMIS Ginna Sed by Ilted in room and E The r	FOR EACH REPORT OF THE PORT OF	H COMPO ORTABLE D EPIX NO TED TED Trypewritten Trypewr	DNENT F CA I NO lines) er Plant e turbin ine Aur formed r Trip F billized e high	AILURE I USE t experie lube to Stop I the ap Respor	SYSTEM 15. EXISUBM DA denced ar oil piping Trip oil pipropriate use. Follow	PECTED ISSION ATE	matical to re sweriginary	MANUFACTUR MONTH creacto the turb vitches proced actor treere perf	r trip oine activures ip, ali	REPO TO fror luberating E-0 Il sared.	Code) RTABLE EPIX YEAR e Oil g), fety

NRC FORM 366A (10-2010) LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) CONTINUATION SHEET 1. FACILITY NAME 2. DOCKET 6. LER NUMBER 3. PAGE

	7011111107111011	VIIIE.					
1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET 6. LER NUMBER				3. PAGE		
R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant	05000244	YEAR 2011	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	2 OF 4		

NARRATIVE

I. DESCRIPTION OF EVENT

A. PRE-EVENT PLANT CONDITIONS:

The reactor was in Operational Mode 1 at 100% power, 2235 psig and 574 degrees F.

B. EVENT:

On October 11, 2011 at 23:28 hours the R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant experienced a Turbine and Reactor Trip. Turbine Lube Oil (TLO) piping internal to the TLO reservoir severed at the 1.5 inch branch line containing the turning gear lube oil pump discharge check valve. This caused a decrease of Auto Stop Trip (AST) oil pressure, which resulted in a turbine and reactor trip when 2 out of 3 AST pressure switches activated on the low oil pressure.

C. INOPERABLE STRUCTURES, COMPONENTS OR SYSTEMS THAT CONTRIBUTED TO THE EVENT:

None

D. DATES AND APPROXIMATE TIMES OF MAJOR OCCURRENCES:

1966-1969	Original construction
10/1997	Inspection performed on check valves and lube oil tank. No concerns noted.
05/2011	Inspection performed on check valves and lube oil tank. No concerns noted.
06/2011	Plant startup from refueling outage
10/11/2011	Weld failure leads to reactor trip

Note: The TLO reservoir is drained, cleaned, and inspected routinely every refueling outage.

E. OTHER SYSTEMS OR SECONDARY FUNCTIONS AFFECTED:

None

F. METHOD OF DISCOVERY:

The turbine and reactor trips were immediately apparent due to plant response, alarms, and indications in the Control Room.

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION NRC FORM 366A (10-2010) **CONTINUATION SHEET** 2. DOCKET 1. FACILITY NAME 6. LER NUMBER 3. PAGE SEQUENTIAL NUMBER R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant 3 OF 4 YEAR 05000244 2011 003 0

G. MAJOR OPERATOR ACTION:

Operations entered procedures E-0, Reactor Trip or Safety Injection and ES-0.1, Reactor Trip Response and stabilized the plant in Mode 3.

H. SAFETY SYSTEM RESPONSES:

The reactor protection system operated as expected as a result of the turbine trip. Motor driven and turbine driven auxiliary feedwater pumps started on the Anticipated Transient Without Scram (ATWS) mitigation system signal. All systems operated as expected.

II. CAUSE OF EVENT:

The cause of this event is attributed to NUREG-1022 Cause Code B, Design, Manufacturing, Construction/Installation.

This event was entered into the site corrective action program (CR-2011-007076). The cause of the piping failure was determined to be high piping stresses from original construction in combination with substandard welding, normal operating conditions, routine maintenance, and cyclical fatigue.

The poor quality of the weld from initial construction created stress risers that served as the crack initiation site. Cold spring forces introduced during initial construction exerted on this short section of bent small bore piping resulted in stress near the yield strength of the pipe. Routine check valve removal and installation practices initiated a crack in the branch connection. Normal system operating vibration propagated the crack through the pipe until the pipe failed.

III ANALYSIS OF THE EVENT:

This event is reportable in accordance with 10 CFR50.73, Licensee Events Report System under item (a)(2)(iv) based on actuation of the Reactor Protection System and Auxiliary Feedwater System.

An assessment was performed considering both the safety consequences and implications of this event with the following conclusions:

The reactor trip breakers opened as required and the control rods inserted as designed. Heatup and pressurization of the Reactor Coolant System (RCS) presented no significant challenge to RCS pressure control systems and no Power Operated Relief Valve (PORV) or safety valve actuation occurred. Maximum steam generator secondary side pressures were well below the atmospheric relief valve pressure setpoint. Automatic actuation of the Motor Driven and Turbine Driven Auxiliary Feedwater pumps occurred as expected due to the ATWS mitigation system on low feedwater flow signal. All auxiliary feedwater pumps performed as expected and met required flow rates.

The plant transient response is bounded by the Loss of External Electrical Load transient analyzed as part of the licensing basis described in the UFSAR.

NRC FORM 366A

(10-2010)

CONTINUATION SHEET

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

	SORTINGATION	CHEL			
1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET		6. LER NUMBER		3. PAGE
R.E. Ginna Nuclear Power Plant	05000244	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	4 OF 4
		2011	- 003 -	0	

Based on the above considerations, the nuclear safety consequences of this event are very low.

This event impacted NRC performance indicator IE01, Unplanned Scrams per 7000 Critical Hours. This value changed from 0 to 0.9. The plant returned to Mode 1 on 10/15/2011.

IV CORRECTIVE ACTIONS:

ACTION TAKEN TO RETURN AFFECTED SYSTEMS TO PRE-EVENT NORMAL Α. STATUS:

Following a minor design change, repairs were performed to the piping and the system was restored to service.

B. ACTION TAKEN OR PLANNED TO PREVENT RECURRENCE

An additional set of flanges were installed in the larger connected piping to facilitate removal and reinstallation of the check valves in this location. Preventive Maintenance activities will be revised for the lube oil and seal oil systems to perform visual inspections of the welding following reassembly of piping with a similar configuration.

V. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

FAILED COMPONENT Α.

1.5 inch branch line piping containing turning gear lube oil pump discharge check valve.

B. PREVIOUS LERS ON SIMILAR EVENTS

A review of recent Ginna events identified one similar event:

LER 2009-002, Plant Trip due to loss of Electro-Hydraulic Control System Pressure

C. THE ENERGY INDUSTRY IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM (EIIS) COMPONENT FUNCTION IDENTIFIER AND SYSTEM NAME OF EACH COMPONENT OR SYSTEM REFERRED TO IN THIS LER:

COMPONENT	IEEE 803 FUNCTION IDENTIFIER	IEEE 805 SYSTEM INDENTIFICATION
5479R	CKV	TD
Piping	PSP	TD

SPECIAL COMMENTS D.

None